

Revista GEAMA – Ciências Ambientais e Biotecnologia Scientific Journal of Environmental Sciences and Biotechnology ISNN: 2447-0740

Agronomic efficiency of liquid inoculant based on Bradyrhizobium japonicum and Azospirillum brasilense for soybean crop

Eficiência agronômica de inoculante líquido a base de Bradyrhizobium japonicum e Azospirillum brasilense para a cultura da soja

Fernanda Kelly da Silva Zilles¹, Mariana Machado Fidelis do Nascimento², Izabeli Isidoro dos Santos¹, Mariana Mendoza de Lima¹, Vinicius de Oliveira Laurindo¹

Contato: fernandazill@hotmail.com

Keyword

soybean germination plant growth final stand

ABSTRACT

This research was conducted with the objective of evaluating the agronomic efficiency of different doses of the product formulated with two nitrogen-fixing bacteria (Bradyrhizobium japonicum and Azospirillum brasilense), in the development of soybean crop, as well as evaluating the possible pathogenic effect of crop treatments. To this end, four studies were installed in the cities of Ponta Grossa – PR, Paranapanema – SP, Bandeirantes – PR and Paranavaí – PR, in the 2020/2021 Harvest. The statistical design used was in randomized blocks, with six treatments and four replications, using the cultivar 58I60 RSF IPRO - BMX LANÇA IPRO. The results obtained in the four soil-climatic locations showed that product inoculation via seed positively influenced the growth of soybean plants and did not cause any symptoms of phytotoxicity. The dose of 300 mL 50 kg seeds 1 of Inoculant tested showed greater stability in the response in the different locations where the studies were conducted. Therefore, it provided an increase in the germination and final stand of plants, an increase in the number of nodules, an increase in the biomass of the shoot and root and a positive increase in the mass of a thousand grains and productivity in relation to the control

Palavras-Chave

soybean germination plant growth final stand

RESUMO

Esta pesquisa foi conduzida com o objetivo de avaliar a eficiência agronômica de diferentes doses do produto formulado com duas bactérias fixadoras de nitrogênio (Bradyrhizobium japonicum e Azospirillum brasilense), no desenvolvimento da cultura da soja, bem como o possível efeito patogênico dos tratamentos da cultura. Para tanto, foram instalados quatro estudos nos municípios de Ponta Grossa – PR, Paranapanema – SP, Bandeirantes – PR e Paranavaí – PR, na Šafra 2020/2021. O delineamento estatístico utilizado foi em blocos casualizados, com seis tratamentos e quatro repetições, utilizando-se a cultivar 58I60 RSF IPRO - BMX LANÇA IPRO. Os resultados obtidos nos quatro locais edoclimáticos mostraram que a inoculação do produto via semente influenciou positivamente o crescimento das plantas de soja, e não causou nenhum sintoma de fitotoxicidade. A dose de 300 mL 50 kg sementes do Inoculante testado apresentou maior estabilidade na resposta nos diferentes locais onde os estudos foram conduzidos. Dessa forma, proporcionou aumento na germinação e estande final das plantas, aumento no número de nódulos, aumento na biomassa da parte aérea e da raiz e aumento positivo na massa de mil grãos e produtividade em relação à testemunha.

Informações do artigo

Recebido: 12 de agosto, 2024 Aceito: 01 de agosto, 2025 Publicado: 30 de agosto, 2025

¹ Innova Agrotecnologia, Foz do Iguaçu, Paraná, Brasil

² Universidade Tecnológica Federal do Paraná

Introduction

The correct management practices can be decisive for the proper conduct of soybean farming to achieve high productivity. Among the practices, the following stand out: biotic elements (pests, diseases and weeds), climate, plant, soil, as well as the interaction between these factors (DOURADO NETO et al., 1998).

Increases in soybean crop productivity are also dependent on plant nutrition (MOREIRA, 1991) and in this sense microorganisms have played an important role, since studies demonstrate that efficient root infection by nitrogen-fixing bacteria has promoted an increase in production (HUNGRIA, 2011).

The formulation of inoculants and/or biofertilizers containing bacteria that promote plant growth and protection, which have shown satisfactory results for various crops (HALLMANN et al., 1997; BALDOTTO et al., 2010). The use of this technology has had a very positive impact on soybean production and others crops, as it considerably reduces the need for nitrogen fertilization, greenhouse gas emission, as well as reducing groundwater contamination by leaching and runoff of nitrite and nitrate (HUNGRIA; MENDES, 2015).

Hungria et al. (2010), showed that strains of Azospirillum brasilense and Azospirillum lipoferum promote increased productivity of corn and wheat, with A. brasilense being the species most used in agriculture for formulating inoculants, and in Latin America there are more than 100 inoculants containing the species as an active ingredient (CASSÁN; DIAZ-ZORITA, 2016). Azospirillum species promote plant growth due to nitrogen fixation, phosphate solubilization, production of phytohormones, among other characteristics, thus, their ability to promote growth is not explained by a single mechanism (BASHAN; DE BASHAN, 2010).

Given the ability of rhizobia to form nodules on plant roots and fix nitrogen, the inoculation of both types of bacteria results in a great alternative for increasing crop productivity. Hungria et al. (2013), observed that the Coinoculation of *Azospirillum* and *Bradyrhizobium species* resulted in an increase of 420 kg.ha⁻¹ in soybean production, when compared to plots without coinoculation. In addition to the increase in productivity, studies have shown an increase in nodulation in soybeans when co-inoculated with *Azospirillum* spp. and *Bradyrhizobium* spp. (BARBOSA et al., 2021).

Based on the literature, new research evaluating the growth promotion of inoculants formulated with *A. brasilense* and *B. japonicum* is a viable alternative for the development of new products. In this sense, the objective of the present study was to evaluate the agronomic efficiency of different doses of the product formulated with two nitrogen-fixing bacteria (*Bradyrhizobium* japonicum e *Azospirillum brasilense*), in the development of the soybean crop, as well as the possible pathogenic effect of the different treatments on the crop.

Material and Methods

Experiments were carried out in the field to validate the agronomic efficiency and viability of the inoculant based on *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* and *Azospirillum brasilense* in promoting the growth and development of soybean (*Glycine max*) in four locations with different soil and climate conditions. The product is registered under number 21000.018572/2022-39. To develop the experiment, the protocols proposed by MAPA (Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Food Supply) for the registration of products from microorganisms that promote plant growth, according to IN 53 (BRASIL, 2013), were applied.

The experiments were carried out during the 2020/21 harvest and in four experimental areas: Ponta Grossa – PR, Paranapanema – SP, Bandeirantes – PR and Paranavaí – PR. All experimental tests were installed in areas of the partner company 3M Experimentação Agrícola. Information about sowing and harvest dates is described below.

Ponta Grossa – PR: The experimental test was installed on December 8, 2020 and the harvest was carried out on April 12, 2021. The soil in the area according to the Brazilian National Soil Program – Pronasolos, is classified as Cambissolo Haplico Aluminum with clay texture (PRONASOLOS, 2021). It has a pH of 6.43, at the time the study was set up, the soil was covered by wheat straw. The area was sown with soybeans and received fertilization of 350 kg ha -1 of formula 10-15-15. The city's climate is classified as humid subtropical (Cfb, according to the Köppen classification), with an average temperature of 17.5°C and average annual rainfall of 1495 mm. Considered edaphoclimatic region 103 by Normative Instruction No. 1 of February 2, 2012 of the Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Supply.

Paranapanema – SP: The research was installed on December 9, 2020, and the harvest was carried out on April 13, 2021, The soil in the area is classified as Dystrophic Red Oxisol with a clayey texture (PRONASOLOS, 2021). It has a pH of 6.18, at the time of installation of the study covered by corn straw. Regarding soybeans, it received fertilization of 400 kg ha -1 of formula 04-14-08. The municipality's climate is classified as subtropical (Cfa, according to the Köppen classification), with temperatures ranging from 14 °C to 30 °C with an average annual rainfall of 1210 mm. Considered edaphoclimatic region 203 by the Normative Instruction.

Bandeirantes – PR: The experiment was installed on December 10, 2020, and the harvest was carried out on April 1, 2021. The soil in the area is classified as a Eutroferric Red Oxisol with a very clayey texture. It has a pH of 5.70 and, at the time of implementing the experiment, it was covered by corn straw. Regarding soybeans, it received fertilization of 285 kg ha -1 of the 10-15-15 formula. The municipality's climate is classified as tropical (Aw, according to the Köppen classification), with an average temperature of 22.2°C and average annual rainfall of 1339 mm. Considered edaphoclimatic region 201 by the Normative Instruction.

Paranavaí – PR: The research was installed on December 11, 2020, and the harvest was carried out on April 15, 2021. The soil in the area is classified as Dystrophic Red Oxisol of medium texture. It has a pH of 4.50 and, at the time of implementing the experiment, it was covered by corn straw. Regarding soybean, it received fertilization of 400 kg ha -1 of formula 04-30-16. The municipality's climate is classified as high-altitude tropical (Cwb, according to the Köppen classification), with temperatures ranging between 14 °C and 32 °C, with an average annual rainfall of 1279 mm. Considered edaphoclimatic region 202 by the Normative Instruction.

The research was conducted in the four locations using a randomized block experimental design with six treatments and four replications. Each plot had a total area of 24.0 m2 (3.0 mx 8.0 m), with a useful area of 5.0 m2.

Soybean was sown with a spacing of 0.50 m between rows and a population density of 300,000 plants per hectare. A base fertilizer was applied with 380 kg ha-1 of formula 02-20-20. Phytosanitary maintenance and cultural treatments for soybeans were carried out in accordance with the recommendations for the crop for each region and following the premise of good agricultural practices.

The experiments were conducted using the soybean cultivar 58I60 RSF IPRO - BMX LANÇA IPRO. This cultivar has medium size, indeterminate growth and maturity group 5.8. It requires high soil fertility, which must be adjusted according to the soil characteristics of each region.

The treatment with nitrogen fertilizer consisted of the application of urea, 50% at sowing and 50% at flowering, with 222 kg.ha⁻¹ of urea being applied in each application, which represented 100 kg.ha⁻¹ of N at sowing and 100 kg ha-1 of N at flowering. The liquid inoculant Rhizonit (Bradyrhizobium japonicum SEMIA 5079/SEMIA5080 -Registration MAPA/PR nº 94581/10000-8) and the liquid inoculant Azonit (Azospirillum brasilense - AbV5/AbV6 – Registration MAPA/PR nº 94581/10011-3), manufactured by Nitro1000 Ind. and Com. Prod. Agricultural and Textile. Ltd., were applied as a positive co-inoculation control, following the manufacturer's recommendations. The tested inoculant based on Bradyrhizobium japonicum and Azospirillum brasilense 1 x 10 9 and 1 x 10 8 UFC mL-1) was applied via seed using three different doses, specified in Table 1.

The effect of the Inoculant formulated (*Bradyrhizobium japonicum* and *Azospirillum brasilense*) on soybean crop with the evaluation of variables carried out at different phenological stages of the crop, coded according to the BBCH scale (2001).

Plant stand: The number of plants emerged in one linear meter, in three central lines. The assessments were carried out in the emergence room (BBCH – 09); 07 days after emergence (7 DAE BBCH – 11); 10 days after emergence (10 DAE BBCH – 12) and at harvest (BBCH – 96).

Plant vigor: For the vigor analysis, all plants present per plot at 10 DAE were considered. The evaluation was carried out visually, assigning a grade from 1 to 7, where: Grade 1: vigor much lower than the control; Grade 2: lower vigor than the control; Grade 3: vigor slightly lower than the control; Grade 4: vigor close to the control; Grade

Paranavaí – PR: The research was installed on 5: vigor equal to control; Grade 6: vigor greater than the cember 11, 2020, and the harvest was carried out on control and Grade 7: vigor much greater than the control.

Nodulation and biomass of the shoot and root: Five complete plants were collected in the central area of the second row of each plot, at the beginning of flowering or in the immediately preceding stage, but always between 35 – 40 days after emergence. The roots were collected using a straight shovel, taking care not to damage them and detach the nodules. Then, the roots were washed and the number of nodules in the first two cm depth of the main root was counted. Subsequently, they were placed to dry in an oven at 65 °C. After drying, the dry mass of the nodules was evaluated. The fresh mass of the aerial part and roots was evaluated and then placed to dry in an oven at 65 °C, until the weight stabilized, then evaluate the dry weight of the aerial part and roots.

Leaf analysis: For leaf analysis, each location was considered as a replication, taking a sample composed of four plants from each plot, at full soybean flowering (BBCH 65). The samples were sent for analysis to Laborsolo Laboratórios.

Productivity: It was evaluated in central plants totaling 5 m2 per plot. The grains were cleaned and weighed, correcting the humidity to 13% and transforming the values into kg ha-1. At the time of harvest, the mass of one thousand grains (MMG) was also evaluated.

Phytotoxicity: The possible pathogenic effect caused to plants by the inoculant formulation under test (*Bradyrhizobium japonicum* and *Azospirillum brasilense* 1 x 10⁹ and 1 x 10⁸ UFC/mL⁻¹), was evaluated by assigning notes to anomalies that were observed, using as a basis the phytotoxicity scale proposed by the EWRC (1964). Assessments were carried out 7 days after emergence (7 DAE BBCH – 11) and 15 days after emergence (15 DAE BBCH – 14).

Statistical analysis: The data obtained were subjected to analysis of variance and, when significant at 5% or 10%, the means of the treatments were compared using the Duncan test, also at the 5% or 10% level of significance, using the statistical program SASM-Agri® [System for analysis and separation of means in agricultural experiments - Canteri et al. (2001).

Climatic Data: Climatic data throughout the study at each location were collected from the first date of the month planted to the last date of the month harvested, with data from the weather station at the location and/or location of the nearest weather station.

Results and Discussion

In Brazil, bacterial inoculants formulated mainly with *Bradyrhizobium japonicum strains* are sold., recommended for soybean cultivation as it meets up to 100% of the crop's nitrogen demand (HUNGRIA; MENDES, 2015), as well as with *Azospirillum brasilense*, recommended for different grass crops (HUNGIRA, 2011) and for use in soy co-inoculation (HUNGRIA; NOGUEIRA; ARAUJO, 2015).

Nowadays the country is a leader in both, food production and the use of inoculants (ANPII, 2019), and with the high adherence to the use of bioinputs, the development of new inoculants continues to expand.

However, co-inoculation of soybean using A. brasilense and Bradyrhizobium spp is a relatively new technology in soybean cultivation and has been recommended by Embrapa Soja since 2015 (HUNGRIA; NOGUEIRA; ARAUJO, 2015). Compared to isolated Bradyrhizobium inoculation, co-inoculation promotes an increase in grain yield and quality (BARBOSA et al., 2021).

The beneficial effects of co-inoculation with A. brasilense and Bradyrhizobium are caused by several mechanisms, including acceleration of biological nitrogen fixation in nodules, increase in nodule dry matter, promotion of the occurrence of heterologous nodulation through increased formation of root hairs and secondary roots, due to the increase in infection sites, inhibition of pathogens (BÁRBARO et al., 2009), in addition to the production of phytohormones by Azospirillum, such as indoleacetic acid (BARBOSA et al., 2021).

The application of the Inoculant via seed, in doses of 100 – 300 mL.50 kg seeds⁻¹, had a positive impact on the germination and final stand of soybean plants, in the four locations where the studies were carried out (Table 2). In Ponta Grossa and Paranavaí, it was observed that the dose of 300 mL.50 kg seeds⁻¹ of the inoculant under test, presented the highest number of plants and statistically differed from the control at the 5% probability level. Compared to the treatment that received nitrogen fertilizer, the treatment was statistically superior to this one (Table 2).

In Paranapanema, the dose of 200 mL.50 kg seeds-1 differed statistically from the control in all evaluations carried out for number of plants (Table 2). It was observed that from 7 DAE, this dose presented a greater number of plants, statistically differing from the treatment with nitrogen fertilizer. In Bandeirantes, it was observed that the treatments that received the inoculant formulated in doses of 100 mL.50 kg seeds⁻¹ and 300 mL.50 kg seeds⁻¹ showed greater stand in the four evaluations carried out, in relation to the control and the treatment with nitrogen fertilization, statistically differing from these (Table 2). It is important to highlight that in the final plant stand evaluated at the time of harvest, the three doses of inoculants tested showed a greater number of plants compared to the control and the treatment which received nitrogen fertilization, statistically differing from these (Table 2).

Compared to the standard co-inoculation treatment, (Rhizonit + Azonit), the stand evaluations at harvest, in the Ponta Grossa study, were statistically similar to the treatment that received the dose of 300 mL.50 kg seeds⁻¹. In Paranapanema, the dose of 200 mL 50 kg seeds⁻¹ was statistically superior in the plant stand at the time of harvest. In Bandeirantes, the standard co-inoculation treatment was statistically similar to the treatments that received doses of 100 mL.50 kg seeds⁻¹ and 300 mL.50 kg seeds-1. In Paranavaí, the three doses of inoculant tested were statistically equal to the co-inoculation standard.

vigor of soybean plants (Table 3), it was observed that the of the plants, observing that the application of the

dose of 300 mL.50 kg seeds⁻¹ was the one that had the greatest positive impact on vigor for the study conducted in Ponta Grossa (Table 3). In Paranapanema and Paranavaí, doses of 200 and 300 mL.50 kg seeds⁻¹ showed greater vigor, statistically differing from the controls. These doses showed a variation of 10% greater in relation to the vigor of the control. In Bandeirantes, the dose of 100 mL.50 kg seeds-1 was the one that showed the greatest vigor, statistically differing from the control and the treatment with nitrogen fertilizer (Table 3). The dose of 100 mL.50 kg seeds-1 showed a 15% higher variation in relation to the vigor of the control.

The results obtained in the present research showed that the Inoculant tested promoted an increase in nodulation in the four locations where the studies were conducted (Table 4), observing a variation between 5.0% and 40.0% in relation to nodulation of the control plots. Increased nodulation due to Bradyrhizobium spp. and A. brasilense co-inoculation was previously found by Chibeba et al. (2015) and Hungria et al. (2015). This characteristic is linked to the fact that Azospirillum stimulates the formation of root hairs and root growth, thus increasing the soil exploration capacity of the root system (CHIBEBA et al., 2015), in addition to changing the morphology of the root system (SAIKIA et al., 2010).

Another factor which contributes to the increase in nodulation is that Azospirillum bacteria, when coinoculated with Bradyrhizobium, stimulate the secretion of flavonoids by the plant (REGO et al., 2018), with daidzein and genistein being the main flavonoids secreted by soybeans (SUGIYAMA et al., 2016; MATSUDA et al., 2020), these flavonoids activate the expression of nodulation genes in rhizobia, which in turn synthesize and lipo-chitooligosaccharides (Nod release (SUGIYAMA et al., 2017; MATSUDA et al., 2020). When the nodal factors are perceived by the roots, a root change is induced that will finally allow the infection of the rhizobia and consequently the morphogenesis of the nodule (SCHWEMBER et al., 2019).

The average nodulation per plant in the four trials was 32.6 nodules, a high value when compared to the average of 17.8 nodules per plant, obtained in the Technical Reference Units of the state of Paraná in the 2019/20 harvest (PRANDO et al., 2020). Prando et al. (2020)demonstrated that co-inoculation of Bradyrhizobium and Azospirillum contributed to average 36% increase in the number of nodules.

soybeans Compared to inoculated Bradyrhizobium alone, co-inoculation can promote an increase in root biomass by an average of 11% (BARBOSA et al., 2021). In the four studies carried out in this report, it was observed that the inoculant tested promoted gains in fresh weight and dry weight of the root (Table 5), observing a variation between 4% and 41.9% in relation to the control for the fresh pasta. For dry mass, a variation between 3.8% and 29.4% was observed in relation to the dry mass of the control plots. The effects of co-inoculation on soybean roots have been observed mainly in increasing root length, volume and branching (MOLLA et al., 2001; RONDINA et al., 2020).

Similar results were obtained regarding the effect Regarding the effect of the tested inoculant on the of the inoculant under test on the biomass of the aerial part inoculant promoted a greater variation in relation to the control between 2.7% and 28.6% for the fresh weight and a variation between 4.2% and 27.7% for dry weight (Table 6).

Hungria et al. (2015), showed that co-inoculation of Bradyrhizobium and Azospirillum promoted an increase in the dry weight of the aerial part, being statistically comparable to the weight obtained in treatments that received nitrogen fertilization. The positive response to Bradyrhizobium and Azospirillum co-inoculation observed in the roots and aerial parts of soybean plants, is associated with the production of hormones (BARBOSA et al., 2021), mainly with mechanisms associated with the production of indolylacetic acid (PUENTE et al., 2018).

The positive effects on nodulation and root development because of Bradyrhizobium and A. brasilense co -inoculation, are also generally associated with an increase in grain yield (BARBOSA et al., 2021), as a consequence of greater nitrogen availability (MORETTI et al., 2020). These records were corroborated in the present research, where in the four locations evaluated it was observed that the application via seed of the inoculant in test promoted an increase in relation to the control of up to 9.7% for the mass of a thousand grains and of up to 11.6 % for productivity values (Table 8). Hungria et al. (2013), proposed that co-inoculation can generate an increase in grain yield of up to 16%, however, the average increase varies between 3.2% (BARBOSA et a., 2021) and 8% as recorded by Prando et al. (2020) in the 2017/18 - 2019/20 harvests in the state of Paraná.

Co-inoculation can contribute to an average increase of 2.8% in the nitrogen content of the shoot (BARBOSA et al., 2021). Although no statistical differences were observed between the N content of the control and the N content of the three doses of test inoculant applied (Table 7), it was observed that the inoculation of test inoculant contributed to an increase of up to 13.8 % compared to the N content in the leaves of the control plots.

The active principle of the tested inoculant (*Bradyrhizobium japonicum* and *Azospirillum brasilense*) did not cause any symptoms of phytotoxicity in the evaluations carried out at 7 and 15 days after emergence, with the soybean plants showing normal development, reaching a score of 1 (no damage) on the proposed scale. by EWRC (1964).

The results obtained in the present research in the four studies conducted in different soil and climate regions corroborate the beneficial effects of co-inoculation with *Bradyrhizobium* and *A. brasilense* previously reported in the literature, indicating that the Inoculant under test (*Bradyrhizobium japonicum* and *Azospirillum brasilense*), is a promising product for use in soybean cultivation.

Conclusion

Based on the results obtained in the four studies conducted in different soil and climate regions, it can be concluded that:

• The inoculant formulated (Bradyrhizobium japonicum and Azospirillum brasilense) via seed,

positively influenced the growth of soybean plants, and did not cause any symptoms of phytotoxicity.

• The dose of 300 mL 50 kg seeds -1 Inoculant under test showed greater stability in the response in the different locations where the studies were conducted.

Therefore, it provided an increase in germination and final plant stand, an increase in the number of nodules, as well as an increase in the biomass of the shoot and root.

- Inoculation with the inoculant formulated, at a dose of 300 mL.50 kg seeds⁻¹, showed a positive increase for the yield components, for thousand grain mass and productivity in relation to the control, with the average increase obtained being 11.60% and 9.70% respectively.
- It is recommended to use the Inoculant (*Bradyrhizobium japonicum* and *Azospirillum brasilense*) via seed in soybean crops, using the dose 300 mL 50 kg seeds⁻¹.

Acknowledgements

We would like to thank the 3M Experimentação Agrícola for the partnership for the field test.

References

BÁRBARO, I. M.; MACHADO, P. C.; JUNIOR, L. S. B.; TICELLI, M.; MIGUEL, F. B.; DA SILVA, J. A. A. Produtividade da soja em resposta à inoculação padrão e co-inoculação. **Colloquium Agrariae**, v. 5, pp. 1-7, 2009.

BARBOSA, J. Z.; HUNGRIA, M.; SENA, J. V. C.; POGGERE, G.; REIS, A. R.; CORRÊA, R. S. Meta-analysis reveals benefits of coinoculation of soybean with Azospirillum brasilense and Bradyrhizobium spp. in Brazil. **Applied Soil Ecology**, v. 163, 103913, 2021.

BASHAN, Y.; DE BASHAN, L. How the Plant Growth-Promoting Bacterium Azospirillum Promotes Plant Growth — A Critical Assessment. **Advances in Agronomy**, v. 108, n. 10, p. 77–136, 2010.

BBCH-ESTÁDIOS DE CULTURAS. Código decimal para a descrição dos estádios de desenvolvimento de plantas. PF/Pesquisa. 2001.

CANTERI, M. G., ALTHAUS, R. A., VIRGENS FILHO, J. S., GIGLIOTI, E. A., GODOY, C. V. SASM - Agri :Sistema para análise e separação de médias em experimentos agrícolas pelos métodos Scoft - Knott, Tukey e Duncan. Revista Brasileira de Agrocomputação, V.1, N.2, p.18-24. 2001.

CASSÁN, F.; DÍAZ-ZORITA, M. Azospirillum sp. in current agriculture: From the laboratory to the field. **Soil Biology & Biochemistry**, v. 103, p. 117–130, 2016.

CHIBEBA, A. M.; GUIMARÃES, M. de F.; BRITO, O. R.; NOGUEIRA, M. A.; ARAUJO, R. S.; HUNGRIA, M. Co-inoculation of soybean with Bradyrhizobium and Azospirillum promotes early nodulation. **American Journal of Plant Sciences**, v. 6, p. 1641-1649, 2015.

 $EWRC.\ \textbf{Report of 3rd and 4th meetings of-committee of methods in weed research.}\ Weed\ Research,\ v.\ 4,\ n.\ 1,\ p.\ 88,\ 1964.$

FAGOTTI, D. S. L.; ABRANTES, J. L. F.; CEREZINI, P.; FUKAMI, J.; NOGUEIRA, M. A.; CERRO, P.; VALDERRAMA-FERNÁNDEZ, R.; OLLERO, F. J.; MEGÍAS, M.; HUNGRIA, M. Quorum sensing communication: *Bradyrhizobium-Azospirillum* interaction via Nacylhomoserine lactones in the promotion of soybean symbiosis. **J. Basic Microbiol.**, v. 59, p. 3853, 2019.

HUNGRIA, M. A.; CONTE, O. Coinoculação da soja com Bradyrhizobium e Azospirillum na safra 2019/2020 no Paraná. Londrina: Embrapa Soja, 2020, 22 p. (Embrapa Soja. Circular Técnica, 166).

HUNGRIA, M.; MENDES, I. C. Nitrogen fixation with soybean: the perfect symbiosis? In: DE BRUIJN, F. J. (Ed.). **Biological nitrogen fixation**. v.2. Hoboken, New Jersey: John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 2015. p. 1009-1023.

HUNGRIA, M.; NOGUEIRA, M. A.; ARAUJO, R. S. Soybean Seed Co-Inoculation with Bradyrhizobium spp. and Azospirillum brasilense: A New Biotechnological Tool to Improve Yield and Sustainability. **American Journal of Plant Sciences**, v. 6, p. 811-817, 2015.

HUNGRIA, M.; NOGUEIRA, M.A.; ARAUJO, R.S. Co-inoculation of soybeans and common beans with rhizobia and azospirilla: strategies to improve sustainability. **Biology and Fertility of Soils**, v. 49, n. 7, p. 791-801, 2013.

HUNGRIA, M. et al. Inoculation with selected strains of *Azospirillum brasilense* and *A. lipoferum* improves yields of maize and wheat in Brazil. **Plant and Soil**, v. 331, n. 1-2, p. 413425, 2010.

MOREIRA, F. M. S.; SIQUEIRA, J. O. **Microbiologia e Bioquímica do Solo**. 2 ed. Atual. E ampl. Lavras. Editora UFLA.2006. 729 pp.

MATSUDA, H., NAKAYASU, M., AOKI, Y., YAMAZAKI, S., NAGANO, A.J., YAZAKI, K., SUGIYAMA, A. Diurnal metabolic regulation of isoflavones and soyasaponins in soybean roots. 2020. bioRxiv.

MOLLA, A. H.; SHAMSUDDIN, Z. H.; HALIMI, M. S.; MORZIAH, M.; PUTEH, A. B. Potential for enhancement of root growth and nodulation of soybean co-inoculated with Azospirillum and Bradyrhizobium in laboratory systems. **Soil Biol Biochem.**, v. 33, p. 457–463, 2001.

MORETTI, L. G.; CRUSCIOL, C. A. C.; BOSSOLANI, J. W.; MOMESSO, L.; GARCIA, A.; KURAMAE, E. E.; HUNGRIA, M. A. Bacterial consortium and microbial metabolites increase grain quality and soybean yield. J. Soil Sci. Plant Nutr., v. 20, p. 1923–1934. 2020.

PRANDO, A. M.; OLIVEIRA, A. B. de; LIMA, D. de; POSSAMAI, E. J.; REIS, E. A.; NOGUEIRA, PRANDO, A. M., BARBOSA, J. Z., OLIVEIRA, A. B. DE, NOGUEIRA, M. A., POSSAMAI, E. J., HUNGRIA, M. (2024). Benefits of soybean co-inoculation with Bradyrhizobium spp. and Azospirillum brasilense: Large-scale validation with farmers in Brazil. European Journal of Agronomy, v.155, p.127112. 2020

PRONASOLOS. Programa Nacional de Solos do Brasil. Embrapa. 2021. Disponível em: https://geoportal.cprm.gov.br/pronasolos/. Acesso em: 26 jul. 2021.

PUENTE, M. L.; GUALPA, J. L.; LOPEZ, G. A.; MOLINA, R. M.; CARLETTI, S. M.; CASSÁN, F. D. The benefits of foliar inoculation with Azospirillum brasilense in soybean are explained by an auxin signaling model. **Symbiosis**, v. 76, p. 41-49, 2018.

REGO, C. H. Q.; CARDOSO, F. B.; CÂNDIDO, A. C. S.; TEODORO, P. E.; ALVES, C. Z. Co-inoculation with Bradyrhizobium and Azospirillum Increases Yield and Quality of Soybean Seeds. **Agronomy Journal**, v. 110, n. 6, p. 2302–2309, 2018.

RONDINA, A. B. L.; SANZOVO, A. W. S.; GUIMARÃES, G. S.; WENDLING, J. R.; NOGUEIRA, M. A.; HUNGRIA, M. Changes in root morphological traits in soybean coinoculated with Bradyrhizobium spp. and Azospirillum brasilense or treated with A. brasilense exudates. **Biol. Fertil. Soils.**, v. 56, p. 537–549, 2020.

SAIKIA, S. P.; DUTTA, S. P.; GOSWAMI, A.; BHAU, B. S.; KANJILAL, P. B. Role of Azospirillum in the Improvement of Legumes. In: Khan, M.S., Zaidi, A. and Musarrat, J., Eds., **Microbes for Legume Improvement**, Springer-Verlag, Wien, 389-408, 2010.

SCHWEMBER, A. R.; SCHULZE, J.; DEL POZO, A.; CABEZA, R. A. Regulation of symbiotic nitrogen fixation in legume root nodules. **Plants**, v. 8 p. 333, 2019.

SUGIYAMA, A., YAMAZAKI, Y., HAMAMOTO, S., TAKASE, H., YAZAKI, K. Synthesis and secretion of isoflavones by field-grown soybean. **Plant Cell Physiol.**, v. 58, p. 1594–1600, 2017.

SUGIYAMA, A.; YAMAZAKI, Y.; YAMASHITA, K.; TAKAHASHI, S.; NAKAYAMA, T.; YAZAKI, K. Developmental and nutritional regulation of isoflavone secretion from soybean roots. **Biosci. Biotechnol. Biochem.** v. 80, p. 89–94, 2016.

TONATTO, M. Potencial de rendimento de cultivares modernos de soja na região sudoeste do Paraná. Dissertação (Mestrado em Agronomia). Programa de Pós-Graduação em Agronomia, Universidade Tecnológica Federal do Paraná (UTFPR). Pato Branco, 2020. 84 p.

Table 1- Description of treatments applied to evaluate the effect of the inoculant in promoting growth in soybean crop. 2020/21 harvest.

	Treatment	Form	ulation	– Dose
	Treatment	Active ingredient	Concentration	- Dose
1	Negative control ¹	-	-	-
2	Positive control ²	-	-	200 kg.ha ⁻¹
3	Co-inoculation ³ [Rhizonit + Azonit]	Bradyrhizobium japonicum + Azospirillum brasilense	$5 \times 10^9 + 2 \times 10^8 \text{UFC mL}^{-1}$	100 + 100 mL.50 Kg seeds ⁻¹
4	Inoculante testado (100)	Bradyrhizobium japonicum + Azospirillum brasilense	1 x 10 ⁹ + 1 x 10 ⁸ UFC mL ⁻¹	100 mL.50 Kg seeds ⁻¹
5	Inoculante testado (200)	Bradyrhizobium japonicum + Azospirillum brasilense	1 x 10 ⁹ + 1 x 10 ⁸ UFC mL ⁻¹	200 mL.50 Kg seeds ⁻¹
6	Inoculante testado (300)	Bradyrhizobium japonicum + Azospirillum brasilense	1 x 10 ⁹ + 1 x 10 ⁸ UFC mL ⁻¹	300 mL.50 Kg seeds ⁻¹

^{1:} Absence of inoculation. 2: Application of N in the form of urea, 50% at sowing and 50% at flowering, representing 100 kg.ha-1 of N in each application. 3: Positive control (co-inoculation with standard products)

Source: the authors, (2024).

Tabela 2. Average plant stand per treatment (N°) and variation in values about the control V(%), in assessments carried out 7 and 10 days after emergence (7 DAE; 10 DAE) and at the time of harvest, in soybean cultivation. 2020/21 harvest.

			P	onta G	rossa - PR	1					Par	anapai	nema - SP			
Treatment		gence /2020 H - 09	7 D 22/12/2 BBCH		10 I 25/12/ BBCF		Har 12/04/ BBCH		Emerg 16/12/2 BBCH	2020	23/12	DAE /2020 H - 11	26/12	DAE 2/2020 H - 12	13/04	rvest /2021 H - 96
	(N°) **	V(%)	(N°) **	V(%)	(N°) **	V(%)	(N°) **	V(%)	(N°) **	V(%)) (N°) **	V(%)	(N°) **	V(%)	(N°) **	V(%)
1	34,50 с	-	38,3 с	-	39,25 с	-	36,00 b	-	33,75 b	-	38,00 c	-	38,50 d	-	37,25 cd	-
2	35,50 bc	2,9	38,8 bc	1,3	39,75 bc	1,3	36,25 b	0,7	34,50 ab	2,2	38,25 bc	0,7	39,00 cd	1,3	37,00 d	-0,7
3	37,50 ab	8,7	39,8 ab	3,9	40,75 ab	3,8	37,00 ab	2,8	35,25 a	4,4	39,75 ab	4,6	40,25 ab	4,5	39,00 b	4,7
4	36,75 ab	6,5	39,5 ab	3,3	40,25 abc	2,5	36,50 ab	1,4	33,75 b	0,0	38,50 bc	1,3	39,50 bcd	2,6	38,50 bc	3,4
5	36,50 abc	5,8	39,8 ab	3,9	40,75 ab	3,8	37,00 ab	2,8	35,50 a	5,2	40,25 a	5,9	41,00 a	6,5	40,75 a	9,4
6	38,00 a	10,1	40,3 a	5,2	41,25 a	5,1	37,50 a	4,2	34,75 ab	3,0	39,50 abc	3,9	40,00 abc	3,9	39,25 b	5,4
Mean	36,46		39,38		40,33		36,71		34,58		39,04		39,71		38,63	
C.V.	3,74		2,00		1,97		1,76		2,60		2,40		1,91		2,39	
				Band	leirantes -	PR]	Parana	vaí - PR			
Treatment	Emer 17/12	gence /2020	7 D. 24/12/		10 DA 27/12/		Har 14/04/2		Emerg 18/12/2		7 DA 25/12/2		10 D 28/12		Harve 15/04/2	

				Band	eirantes -	PR			_			Parana	vaí - PR			
Treatment	Emer 17/12/ BBCI	2020	7 D. 24/12/ BBCF	2020	10 DA 27/12/ BBCH	2020	Har 14/04/2 BBCH		Emerg 18/12/2 BBCH	2020	7 DA 25/12/2 BBCH	2020	10 D 28/12/ BBCI	2020	Harves 15/04/2 BBCH	021
	(N°) **	V(%)	(N°) **	V(%)	(N°) **	V(%)	(N°) **	V(%)	(N°) **	V(%)	(N°) **	V(%)	(N°) **	V(%)	(N°) **	V(%)
1	35,00 bc	-	40,00 b	-	40,25 b	-	39,00 с	-	33,25 b	-	37,75 с	-	39,00 с	-	37,50	-
2	34,50 c	-1,4	39,75 b	-0,6	40,25 b	0,0	39,25 bc	0,6	33,50 b	0,8	37,75 c	0,0	38,75 с	-0,6	37,25 b	-0,7
3	36,75 ab	5,0	41,75 ab	4,4	42,50 a	5,6	41,50 ab	6,4	34,00 b	2,3	39,00 bc	3,3	40,50 b	3,8	39,25 a	4,7
4	37,00 a	5,7	42,25 a	5,6	43,50 a	8,1	42,50 a	9,0	35,00 ab	5,3	39,25 b	4,0	40,75 b	4,5	39,50 a	5,3
5	36,75 ab	5,0	41,25 ab	3,1	42,00 ab	4,3	40,75 abc	4,5	34,25 ab	3,0	39,50 b	4,6	41,00 b	5,1	40,25 a	7,3
6	37,00 a	5,7	42,75 a	6,9	43,75 a	8,7	42,25 a	8,3	36,25 a	9,0	40,75 a	7,9	42,25 a	8,3	40,75 a	8,7
Mean	36,17		41,29		42,04		40,88		34,38		39,00		40,38		38,63	
C.V.	3,31	<u> </u>	3,23		2,76	<u> </u>	3,67		2,69		2,06	<u> </u>	1,63	<u> </u>	2,39	

CV = Coefficient of variation (%).

Means followed by the same letter in the column do not differ from each other using the Duncan test at the level of 5% (**) or 10% (*) of probability. Source: the authors, (2024).

Table 3. Average vigor (grade) of plants per treatment and variation in values about the control V(%), in evaluations carried out 10 days after emergence (10 DAE) in soybean crops. 2020/21 harvest.

Treatment	Ponta	Gros	sa - PR	Paran	apaneı	na – SP	Bande	irantes -	- PR	Parana	vaí - P	R
	Grade	*	V(%)	Grade	*	V(%)	Grade	*	V	Grade	*	V(%)
1	5	b	-	5	b	-	5	b	-	5	a	-
2	5	b	0,0	5	b	0	5	b	0	5	a	0
3	5.5	a	10	5.5	ab	10	5.5	ab	10	5.25	a	5
4	5.25	b	5	5	b	0	5	b	0	5	a	0
5	5.25	ab	5	5.5	ab	5	5.25	b	5	5	a	0
6	5.5	ab	10	5.75	a	15	5.5	ab	10	5.5	a	10
Mean	5.25			5.29			5.32			5.18		
CV	6.35			6.42			6.8			6.99		

CV = Coefficient of variation (%).

Means followed by the same letter in the column do not differ from each other using the Duncan test at the level of 5% (**) or 10% (*) of probability. Source: the authors, (2024).

Table 4. Average number and dry mass of nodules per treatment (N°) and variation in values about the control V(%), in evaluations carried out at the beginning of flowering (BBCH – 51) in soybean. 2020/21 harvest.

	Ponta Gr	ossa - P	R				Paranap	oanema	- SP			
Treatment	Nodules			Nodule	s mass		Nodules			Nodule	s mass	
	N°	**	V(%)	(g)	**	V(%)	N°	**	V(%)	(g)	**	V(%)
1	200,25	С	-	1,57	ь	-	141,5	b	-	1,56	bc	-
2	218,75	bc	9,2	1,63	b	3,8	143,75	b	1,6	1,52	c	-2,4
3	245,25	abc	22,5	1,91	ab	21,5	159,75	ab	12,9	1,67	ab	7,1
4	245,25	bc	11,9	1,67	ab	6,6	150	ab	6	1,57	bc	0,6
5	224	ab	32,6	1,92	ab	22,5	168,25	a	18,9	1,77	A	13,3
6	263.5	a	40	2,06	a	31,4	158,5	ab	12	1,69	ab	8,5
Mean	280,25			1,79			153,63			1,63		
CV	238,67			11,31			7,42			5,13		
	Bandeira	ntes - Pl	R				Paranay	aí – Pk	2			

	Bandeira	ntes - P	R				Paranav	aí – PR				
Treatment	Nodules			Nodule	s mass		Nodules			Nodule	s mass	
	N°	**	V(%)	(g)	**	V(%)	N°+	**	V(%)	(g)	**	V(%)
1	184	b	-	1,38	b	-	159	cd	-	1,21	bc	-
2	173,75	b	-5,6	1,35	b	1.1	153,5	d	-3,5	1,15	c	-4,4
3	217,25	ab	18,01	1,54	b	15.1	168,25	abc	5,8	1,32	ab	9,1
4	231,5	a	25,8	1,61	b	3.4	167	bc	5	1,31	abc	8,3
5	205,75	ab	11,8	1,5	b	8,7	173,25	ab	9	1,29	abc	7,3
6	242,75	a	31,9	1,76	b	19.6	180	a	13,2	1,42	a	17,6
Mean	209,17			1,52			166,83			1,28		
CV	13,03			10,9			4,77			7,56		

CV = Coefficient of variation (%). Means followed by the same letter in the column do not differ from each other using the Duncan test at the level of 5% (**) or 10% (*) of probability.

Source: the authors, (2024).

Table 5. Average weight of fresh mass and dry mass of roots and variation in values about the control V(%), in evaluations carried out at the

beginning of flowering (BBCH – 51) in soybean crops. 2020/21 harvest.

]	Ponta Gr	ossa - PR					Paranapa	nema – S	P	
Treatment	Fre	esh ma	ISS	D	ry ma	SS	F	resh ma	ISS		Dry mas	SS
	(g)	*	V(%)	(g)	*	V(%)	(g)	*	V(%)	(g)	*	V(%)
1	99,75	b	-	52	b	-	80,75	С	-	31	bc	-
2	106	b	6,3	52,25	b	0,5	83	bc	2,8	31	c	0
3	121,25	ab	21,6	57	ab	9,6	88,25	abc	9,3	35,75	abc	15,3
4	108	b	8,3	54	b	3,8	84	bc	4	32,25	abc	4
5	125,5	ab	25,8	57,5	ab	10,6	92,75	a	14,9	40	abc	29
6	141	a	41,9	65,25	a	25,5	87,5	ab	8,4	34	a	9,7
Mean				56,33			85,04			34		
CV				9,81			7,43			11,4		

]	Bandeira	ntes - PR					Parana	vaí – PR		
Treatment	Fr	esh ma	ss	D	ry ma	ss	F	resh ma	ISS		Dry mas	SS
	(g)	*	V(%)	(g)	*	V(%)	(g)	*	V(%)	(g)	*	V(%)
1	85,5	b	-	34	b	-	77,75	b	-	39,25	b	-
2	87,25	b	2	34,25	b	0,7	77,25	b	-0,6	39	b	-0,6
3	99,25	ab	16,1	37,5	ab	10,3	86,75	ab	12	42	b	7
4	109	a	27,5	44	a	29,4	84	ab	8	41	b	4,5
5	96,75	ab	13,2	40	ab	17,6	84,5	ab	8,7	43,25	ab	10,2
6	106	a	24	41,5	a	22,1	94,75	a	22	47,5	a	21
Mean	97,29			38,54			84,17			42		
CV	9,92			11,37			8,13			8,07		

Means followed by the same letter in the column do not differ from each other using the Duncan test at the level of 5% (**) or 10% (*) of probability. CV = Coefficient of variation (%);

Source: the authors, (2024).

Table 6. The average weight of fresh mass and dry mass of the aerial part and variation in values about the control V(%), in evaluations carried out at the beginning of flowering (BBCH – 51) in the soybean crop. 2020/21 harvest.

,			Ponta G	rossa - PR					Paranapa	nema – SP		
Treatment	Fr	esh ma	iss	I	Ory mas	S	Fr	esh ma	ass	D	ry ma	ss
	(g)	*	V(%)	(g)	*	V(%)	(g)	*	V(%)	(g)	*	V(%)
1	945,75	b	-	372,5	c	-	890,5	b	-	341,75	b	-
2	949,5	b	0,4	378,25	c	1,5	908,5	b	2	343	b	0,4
3	1038	ab	9,8	422,25	bc	13,4	998,75	ab	12,2	390	ab	14,1
4	971	b	2,7	391,	c	5	957,5	b	7,5	356	b	4,2
5	1039,75	ab	9,9	458	ab	23	1095	a	23	426,25	a	24,7
6	1120	a	18,4	475,75	a	27,7	995	ab	11,7	378,50	ab	10,8
Mean	1010,67			416,33			974,21			372,58		
CV	10,8			7,46			8,31			9,21		
<u> </u>	•		Randeir	antes - PR					Parana	vaí – PR		

			Bandeir	antes - PR					Parana	vaí – PR		<u></u>
Treatment	Fre	esh ma	ass]	Dry mas	s	Fr	esh m	ass	D	ry ma	ss
	(g)	*	V(%)	(g)	*	V(%)	(g)	*	V(%)	(g)	*	V(%)
1	900,25	b	-	374,25	bc	-	742,5	b	-	311	c	-
2	915,25	b	1,7	365,75	c	-2,3	753,75	b	1,5	316,25	c	1,7
3	1016,75	ab	12,9	411	abc	9,8	905	a	21,9	356,25	ab	14,5
4	1063,25	a	18,1	457,75	a	22,3	811,25	b	9,3	331	bc	6,4
5	974,5	ab	8,2	402,75	abc	7,6	931,25	a	25,4	345,75	b	11,2
6	1068,25	a	18,7	430,25	ab	15	955	a	28,6	377,25	a	21,3
Mean	989,71			406,96			849,79			339,58		<u>.</u>
CV	8,16			9,34			6,69			5,46		

Means followed by the same letter in the column do not differ from each other using the Duncan test at the level of 5% (**) or 10% (*) of probability. CV = Coefficient of variation (%);

Source: the authors, (2024).

Table 7. Comparison of average productivity, thousand-grain mass (MMG) and increase in production values about the control (V%) in soybean, cultivar 58I60 RSF IPRO – BMX LANÇA IPR. 2020/21 harvest.

			Ponta	Grossa - PR					Paranaj	oanema – SP		
Treatment	MMG			Productivit	ty			MMG		Pro	ductivity	y
	(g)	*	V(%)	(kg.ha ⁻¹)	*	V(%)	(g)	*	V(%)	(kg.ha ⁻¹)	*	\mathbf{V}
1	161	b	-	2757,13	b	-	162,75	c	-	3165,43	b	-
2	160,25	b	-0,5	2775,79	b	0,7	160,75	c	-1,2	3201,20	ab	1,1
3	166,75	ab	3,6	2925,73	ab	6,2	168,25	bc	3,4	3388,64	ab	7,1
4	163,75	ab	1,7	2864,95	ab	3,9	163,75	c	0,6	3249,86	ab	2,7
5	168,5	a	4,7	2922,11	ab	6	172,75	ab	6,1	3494,96	a	10,4
6	170,25	a	5,8	3077,45	a	11,6	169,5	a	4,1	3429,13	ab	8,3
Mean	165,8			2887,19			166,29			3321,5		
CV	2.55			4.75			2.71			6.51		

			Bande	eirantes - PR					Parar	iavaí – PR		
Treatment	MMG			Productivi	ty		MMG			Productivit	y	
	(g)	*	V(%)	(kg.ha ⁻¹)	*	V(%)	(g)	*	V(%)	(kg.ha ⁻¹)	*	\mathbf{V}
1	162,25	b	-	3353,03	с	-	152,5	С	-	3323,33	b	-
2	162,5	b	0,2	3572,37	bc	1,1	150,75	c	-1,1	3343,34	b	0,6
3	169,5	a	4,5	3733,81	abc	5,7	161	ab	5,6	3463,05	ab	4,2
4	174,25	a	7,4	3850,9	a	9	161,5	c	5,9	3476,71	ab	4,6
5	170	a	4,8	3747,18	abc	6,1	163,75	bc	7,4	3559,76	ab	7,1
6	173	a	6,6	3824,97	ab	8,3	167,25	ab	9,7	3671,98	a	10,5
Mean	168,58			3710,38			159,46			3473,03		
CV	2,15			4,4			3,01			4,42		

Means followed by the same letter in the column do not differ from each other using the Duncan test at the level of 5% (**) or 10% (*) of probability. CV = Coefficient of variation (%). Source: the authors, (2024).

Table 8. Micronutrient content present in the plant tissue of the aerial part by treatment, in the soybean crop. 2020/21 harvest. The values represent the average of the results of the four locations: Ponta Grossa, Paranapanema, Bandeirantes and Paranavaí.

	Cu		Co		Se		V	
Treatment	mg.kg ⁻¹							
		*		*		*		*
1	9,54	b	0,42	b	1,39	a	3,34	c
2	10,08	b	0,47	ab	0,69	b	4,04	bc
3	11,07	ab	0,39	b	0,94	ab	4,03	bc
4	9,90	b	0,5	ab	0,79	b	4,4	abc
5	12,74	a	0,58	a	0,62	b	5,44	a
6	9,97	b	0,54	a	0,49	b	4,96	ab
Mean	10,55		0,48		0,82		4,36	
CV	12,93		18,1		48,4		22,1	

Means followed by the same letter in the column do not differ from each other using the Duncan test at the level of 5% (**) or 10% (*) of probability. CV= Coefficient of variation (%);

Source: the authors, (2024).